

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO AND OAKLAND DIVISION

Case No. 3:22-cv-07557-SI

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]  
ORDER TO ADMINISTRATIVELY  
RELATE CASES PURSUANT TO  
CIVIL LOCAL RULE 3-12 AND  
CONSOLIDATE RELATED ACTIONS  
UNDER FED. R. CIV. P. 42(a)**

Defendant.

Case No. 5:22-cv-09149-SI

Defendant.

CRYSTAL CRAIG, TIFFANY )  
 BRYANT and SAIT ) Case No. 3:23-cv-00315-TLT  
 KURMANGALIYEV, Individually and )  
 on Behalf of All Others Similarly )  
 Situated, )  
 )  
 Plaintiffs, )  
 )  
 v. )  
 )  
 META PLATFORMS, INC., )  
 )  
 Defendant. )

WHEREAS, the above-captioned related putative consumer class actions are pending before the United States District Court for the Northern District of California, entitled: *John Doe, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc.*, Case No. 3:22-CV-07557-SI, filed December 1, 2022 (“*Doe*”); *Katrina Calderon, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc.*, Case No. 5:22-cv-09149-SI (“*Calderon*”), filed December 29, 2022; and *Craig v. Meta Platforms, Inc.*, Case No. 3:23-cv-00315-TLT (“*Craig*”) filed January 23, 2023 (the “Related Actions” and all plaintiffs are collectively referred to herein as “Plaintiffs”);

WHEREAS, by Order dated January 24, 2023, this Court administratively related the *Doe* and *Calderon* Actions pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3-12;

WHEREAS, *Craig* also meets the definition of a related case under Civil Local Rule 3-12 because it is brought against the same defendant, Meta Platforms, Inc., involves similar allegations that Meta surreptitiously acquired tax filing information from putative class members who used online tax filing websites such as H&R Block, Tax Act, and Tax Slayer, and asserts many of the same causes of action;

1 WHEREAS, there is the potential for burdensome duplication of labor and expense, and  
2 the potential for conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different judges such that they  
3 should be designated as Related under Civil Local Rule 3-12;

4 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs assert the Related Actions arise out of the same or a similar set of  
5 operative facts and assert similar legal claims against Defendant Meta Platforms, Inc. (“Meta” or  
6 “Defendant”), alleging that Meta’s “Pixel” is a piece of code that logs users’ activities on third-  
7 party websites and sends the details back to Meta. Plaintiffs allege that online tax-filing services  
8 such as H&R Block, TaxAct, and TaxSlayer embedded the Pixel in their websites and sent tens of  
9 millions of filers’ tax-return data to Meta without their consent in violation of federal law.  
10 Plaintiffs further allege the Pixel sent Meta the tax-filers’ names, email addresses, adjusted gross  
11 incomes, tax-filing statuses, refund amounts, dependents’ college scholarship amounts, and their  
12 dependents’ names—and perhaps more. Plaintiffs further allege this occurred regardless of  
13 whether the filer had an account on Meta’s social media platforms like Facebook or Instagram,  
14 and even when filers expressly declined to share their information, the Pixel collected it anyway.  
15 (Doe ¶¶ 1-2; Calderon ¶¶ 43-51; Craig ¶¶ 2-18);

16  
17  
18 WHEREAS, in light of the foregoing, the Related Actions should be consolidated for all  
19 purposes pursuant to Rule 42(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure;

20 WHEREAS, the parties have met and conferred and stipulate to the following:

21 1. The case file for the Consolidated Action will be maintained under Master File  
22 No.3:22-CV-07557-SI. When a pleading is intended to apply to all actions to which this Order  
23 applies, the words “All Actions” shall appear immediately after the words “This Document Relates  
24 To:” in the caption described above. When a pleading is not intended to apply to all actions, the  
25 docket number for each individual action to which the paper is intended to apply and the last name  
26

of the first-named plaintiff in said action shall appear immediately after the words “This Document Relates To:” in the caption identified above, for example, “3:22-cv-07557-SI, All Actions.”

2. All papers filed in the Consolidated Action shall be filed under Case No. 3:22-cv-007557-SI and shall bear the following caption:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE META PIXEL TAX FILING CASES	)	Master File No. 3:22-cv-07557-SI
	)	
This Document Relates to:	)	
	)	

3. Any action subsequently filed, transferred, or removed to this Court that the Court determines arises out of the same or similar operative facts as the Consolidated Action will be, with the Court’s approval, consolidated with the Consolidated Action for all purposes. Any party may file a Notice of Related Action pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3.12 whenever a party believes a case that should be consolidated into the Consolidated Action is filed in, or transferred to, this District. If the Court determines that the case is related and should be consolidated, the clerk shall:

- a. place a copy of this Order in the separate file for such action;
- b. serve on Plaintiffs’ counsel in the new case a copy of this Order;
- c. direct that this Order be served upon defendants in the new case; and
- d. make the appropriate entry in the Master Docket.

4. A Consolidated Complaint shall be filed forty-five (45) days after entry of an order appointing interim class counsel in the Consolidated Action.

1           5.       Meta shall not be required to respond to the complaint in any action consolidated  
2 into this action, other than the Consolidated Complaint.

3           6.       Meta shall respond to the Consolidated Complaint within sixty (60) days of the  
4 filing thereof. If Meta files a motion to dismiss the Consolidated Complaint, Plaintiffs shall file  
5 their papers in opposition to Meta's motion to dismiss within forty-five (45) days of the filing  
6 thereof. Meta shall file its reply brief within thirty (30) days of the filing of Plaintiffs' opposition  
7 papers.  
8

9           7.       Plaintiffs shall promptly confer on a leadership structure and file any stipulation or  
10 motion within five (5) days after entry of the Order consolidating all actions.

11           **IT IS SO STIPULATED**

12  
13 Dated: February 7, 2023

LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P.  
Robert K. Shelquist  
Rebecca A. Peterson (California # 241858)  
Kate M. Baxter-Kauf

14  
15  
16 By: /s/ Rebecca A. Peterson

17 100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200  
18 Minneapolis, MN 55401  
19 Telephone: (612) 339-6900  
20 Facsimile: (612) 339-0981  
21 E-mail: rkshelquist@locklaw.com  
rapeterson@locklaw.com  
kmbaxter-kauf@locklaw.com

22 GEORGE GESTEN MCDONALD, PLLC  
23 Lori G. Feldman. (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
24 102 Half Moon Bay Drive  
25 Croton-on-Hudson, New York 10520  
26 Phone: (917) 983-9321  
Fax: (888) 421-4173  
Email: LFeldman@4-justice.com  
E-Service: eService@4-Justice.com

GEORGE GESTEN MCDONALD, PLLC  
David J. George. (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
Brittany L. Brown. (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)  
9897 Lake Worth Road, Suite #302  
Lake Worth, FL 33467  
Phone: (561) 232-6002  
Fax: (888) 421-4173  
Email: DGeorge@4-Justice.com  
E-Service: eService@4-Justice.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Crystal Craig, Tiffany  
Bryant, and Sait Kurmangaliyev*

Dated: February 8, 2023

BURSOR & FISHER, P.A.

By: /s/ Joel D. Smith  
Joel D. Smith

Joel D. Smith (State Bar No. 244902)  
Neal J. Deckant (State Bar No. 322946)  
1990 North California Blvd., Suite 940  
Walnut Creek, CA 94596  
Telephone: (925) 300-4455  
Facsimile: (925) 407-2700  
E-mail: jsmith@bursor.com  
ndeckant@bursor.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Katrina Calderon and  
Danielle Calderon*

Dated: February 7, 2023

THE HODA LAW FIRM, PLLC

By: /s/ Marshal J. Hoda  
Marshal J. Hoda

Marshal J. Hoda (TX State Bar No. 24110009)  
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
12333 Sowden Road, Suite B, PMB 51811  
Houston, TX 77080  
Telephone: (832) 848-0036  
Facsimile: (832) 201-0364  
E-mail: marshal@thehodalawfirm.com

FOSTER YARBOROUGH, PLLC  
Patrick Yarborough (TX State Bar No. 24084129)  
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
917 Franklin Street, Suite 220  
Houston, TX 77002  
Telephone: (713) 331-5254  
E-mail: patrick@fosteryarborough.com

THE LAW OFFICES OF STEVEN C. VONDRAN  
Steven C. Vondran  
California Bar No. 232337  
One Sansome Street, Suite 3500  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (877) 276-5084  
E-mail: steve@vondranlegal.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Jane Doe and John Doe*

Dated: February 7, 2023

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

By: /s/ Lauren R. Goldman  
Lauren R. Goldman

LAUREN R. GOLDMAN (pro hac vice)  
lgoldman@gibsondunn.com  
200 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10166  
Telephone: (212) 351-4000  
Facsimile: (212) 351-4035

ELIZABETH K. MCCLOSKEY (SBN 268184)  
emccloskey@gibsondunn.com  
ABIGAIL A. BARRERA (SBN 301746)  
abarrera@gibsondunn.com  
555 Mission Street, Suite 3000  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 393-8200  
Facsimile: (415) 393-8306

1 ANDREW M. KASABIAN (SBN 313210)  
2 akasabian@gibsondunn.com  
3 333 South Grand Avenue  
4 Los Angeles, CA 90071  
5 Telephone: (213) 229-7311  
6 Facsimile: (213) 229-6311

7 *Attorneys for Defendant Meta Platforms, Inc.*

8 COOLEY LLP  
9 MICHAEL G. RHODES (SBN 116127)  
10 rhodesmg@cooley.com  
11 KYLE C. WONG (SBN 224021)  
12 kwong@cooley.com  
13 CAROLINE A. LEBEL (SBN 340067)  
14 clebel@cooley.com  
15 3 Embarcadero Center, 20th Floor  
16 San Francisco, CA 94111-4004  
17 Telephone: (415) 693-2000

18 *Attorneys for Defendant Meta Platforms, Inc.*



**Certification of Compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3)**

I hereby certify that pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), I have obtained the authorization from the above signatories to file the above-referenced document, and that the above signatories concur in the filing's content.

By: /s/ Marshal J. Hoda

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hon. Susan Illston  
U.S. DISTRICT COURT JUDGE